Monitoring Corruption: Evidence from a Field Experiment in Indonesia
Additional Tables
Benjamin A. Olken
December 30, 2006

This document contains some additional tables referred to, but not presented in, "Monitoring Corruption: Evidence from a Field Experiment in Indonesia".

Version of Table 4 with all village controls from Table 2:
As discussed in the text in Section 3.1

	No Fixed Effects		Engineer Fixed Effects		Stratum Fixed Effects		
Percent missing: *Log reported value – Log actual value*	Audit Effect	P-Value	Audit Effect	P-Value	Audit Effect	P-Value	Num Obs
Major items in roads	-0.075*	0.089	-0.073**	0.042	-0.046	0.141	463
	(0.044)		(0.036)		(0.031)		
Major items in roads and ancillary projects	-0.077*	0.071	-0.079**	0.033	-0.079**	0.017	522
	(0.042)		(0.037)		(0.033)		
Breakdown of roads:							
Materials	-0.068	0.191	-0.065	0.115	-0.034	0.372	463
	(0.052)		(0.041)		(0.038)		
Unskilled labor	-0.081	0.455	-0.079	0.389	-0.036	0.621	414
	(0.107)		(0.092)		(0.073)		
All village controls from Table 2	YES		YES		YES		

Notes: Audit effect, standard errors, and p-values are computed by estimating equation (1), a regression of the dependent variable on a dummy for audit treatment, invitations treatment and invitations + comment forms treatments, plus all village controls listed in Table 2. Robust standard errors in parentheses, allowing for clustering by subdistrict (to account for clustering of treatment by subdistrict). Each 'audit effect', standard error, and accompanying p-value is from a separate regression. Each row shows a different dependent variable, shown at left. All dependent variables are the log of the value reported by the village less the log of the estimated actual value, which is approximately equal to the percent missing. Villages are included in each row only if there was positive reported expenditures for the dependent variable listed in that row. * significant at 10%; ** significant at 5%; *** significant at 1%

Version of Table 11 with all village controls from Table 2:
As discussed in the text in Section 3.1
Panel A: Invitations

Percent missing: Log reported value – Log actual value	No Fixed Effects Invite Effect	P-Value	Engineer Fixed Effects Invite Effect	P-Value	Stratum Fixed Effects Invite Effect	P-Value	Num Obs
Major items in roads	-0.030	0.417	-0.036	0.304	-0.022	0.524	463
	(0.036)		(0.035)		(0.035)		
Major items in roads and ancillary projects	-0.026	0.445	-0.029	0.393	-0.023	0.484	522
	(0.034)		(0.033)		(0.033)		
Breakdown of roads:							
Materials	-0.001	0.981	-0.003	0.946	0.014	0.713	463
	(0.039)		(0.038)		(0.037)		
Unskilled labor	-0.184*	0.056	-0.225**	0.019	-0.183**	0.042	414
	(0.095)		(0.095)		(0.090)		
All village controls from Table 2	YES		YES		YES		

Panel B: Invitations + Comments

Percent missing: Log reported value – Log actual value	No Fixed Effects Invite + Com-ment Effect	P-Value	Engineer Fixed Effects Invite + Com-ment Effect	P-Value	Stratum Fixed Effects Invite + Com-ment Effect	P-Value	Num Obs
Major items in roads	-0.024	0.455	-0.022	0.465	-0.016	0.610	463
	(0.031)		(0.031)		(0.032)		
Major items in roads and ancillary projects	-0.015	0.630	-0.015	0.624	-0.017	0.604	522
	(0.032)		(0.031)		(0.032)		
Breakdown of roads:							
Materials	-0.048	0.166	-0.036	0.297	-0.015	0.677	463
	(0.035)		(0.034)		(0.035)		
Unskilled labor	-0.033	0.722	-0.082	0.369	-0.084	0.395	414
	(0.094)		(0.091)		(0.099)		
All village controls from Table 2	YES		YES		YES		

Change in Reported Expenditures and change in Actual Expenditures

As discussed in the text in Section 5.2.1

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
	Log(Final report) – Log(Initial Budget)			Log(Actual Expenditures) – Log(Initial Budget)		
	Major Items in Road	Materials	Unskilled labor	Major Items in Road	Materials	Unskilled labor
Audit	0.012	0.012	0.016	0.064	0.075	0.072
	(0.024)	(0.026)	(0.060)	(0.046)	(0.055)	(0.121)
Invitations	0.020	0.011	-0.064	0.058*	0.038	0.079
	(0.035)	(0.031)	(0.073)	(0.031)	(0.036)	(0.089)
Comment	0.016	0.026	-0.072	0.030	0.053	-0.079
	(0.023)	(0.024)	(0.056)	(0.031)	(0.034)	(0.070)
Constant	-0.067***	-0.062***	0.037	-0.333***	-0.301***	-0.322***
	(0.021)	(0.018)	(0.054)	(0.036)	(0.039)	(0.099)
Observations	489	489	425	473	472	408
R-squared	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.01	0.01	0.01

Robust standard errors in parentheses, adjusted for clustering at the subdistrict level.
* significant at 10%; ** significant at 5%; *** significant at 1%

Investigating Phase I vs. Phase II audit villages

As discussed in the text in Section 5.2.1

	(1)	(2)	(3)
	No FE	Engineer FE	Audit Stratum FE
Audit	-0.085*	-0.072*	-0.045
	(0.046)	(0.039)	(0.034)
Invitations	-0.021	-0.030	-0.020
	(0.035)	(0.034)	(0.034)
Invitations + comment forms dummy	-0.022	-0.024	-0.018
	(0.030)	(0.029)	(0.028)
Audit Phase I Dummy	-0.0003	-0.018	-0.015
	(0.044)	(0.044)	(0.047)
Observations	477	477	477
R-squared	0.02	0.18	0.35

Notes: Robust standard errors in parentheses, adjusted for clustering at subdistrict level.
* significant at 10%; ** significant at 5%; *** significant at 1%

Version of Table 4 dropping villages Audited in Phase I
As discussed in the text in Section 5.2.1

Percent missing: Log reported value – Log actual value	Control Mean	Treatment Mean: Audits Phase II villages only	No Fixed Effects Audit Effect	No Fixed Effects P-Value	Engineer Fixed Effects Audit Effect	Engineer Fixed Effects P-Value	Stratum Fixed Effects Audit Effect	Stratum Fixed Effects P-Value	Num Obs
Major items in roads	0.277	0.192	-0.085*	0.067	-0.069*	0.078	-0.037	0.274	424
	(0.033)	(0.032)	(0.046)		(0.039)		(0.034)		
Major items in roads and ancillary projects	0.291	0.192	-0.099**	0.023	-0.089**	0.021	-0.090**	0.015	476
	(0.030)	(0.031)	(0.043)		(0.038)		(0.037)		
Breakdown of roads:									
Materials	0.240	0.161	-0.079	0.154	-0.057	0.201	-0.025	0.543	424
	(0.038)	(0.039)	(0.055)		(0.045)		(0.041)		
Unskilled labor	0.312	0.253	-0.056	0.623	-0.051	0.557	-0.016	0.824	379
	(0.080)	(0.080)	(0.113)		(0.087)		(0.070)		

Notes: This table reproduces Table 4, dropping all villages that were randomly selected to be audited in Phase I.
* significant at 10%; ** significant at 5%; *** significant at 1%

Spillovers of audit treatment in control villages

As discussed in footnote 11

$$PERCENTMISSING_v = \alpha + \beta_1 DISTANCETOAUDIT_v + \beta_2 INVITE_v + \beta_3 COMMENT_v + \varepsilon_v$$

	(1)	(2)	(3)
	No FE	Engineer FE	Audit Stratum FE
Distance in km to nearest audit village	-0.002	0.004	-0.000
	(0.005)	(0.004)	(0.004)
Invitations dummy	-0.033	-0.040	-0.022
	(0.041)	(0.036)	(0.038)
Invitations + comment forms dummy	-0.050	-0.046	-0.034
	(0.041)	(0.035)	(0.034)
Observations	253	253	253
R-squared	0.00	0.30	0.55

Robust standard errors in parentheses, adjusted for clustering at subdistrict level. Sample is limited to villages that did not receive an audit.

* significant at 10%; ** significant at 5%; *** significant at 1%

Estimating treatment effects with median regressions

As discussed in footnote 34

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
	Percent missing in…			
	Main road	Main road + ancillary	Materials	Unskilled labor
Audit	-0.074*	-0.108***	-0.095*	-0.036
	(0.040)	(0.032)	(0.051)	(0.078)
Invitations	-0.047	-0.050	-0.002	-0.055
	(0.036)	(0.033)	(0.042)	(0.093)
Invitations + Comments	-0.043	-0.048*	-0.039	-0.077
	(0.034)	(0.028)	(0.040)	(0.099)
Constant	0.289***	0.330***	0.244***	0.403***
	(0.040)	(0.032)	(0.047)	(0.098)
Observations	.	.	.	.

Notes: Results from median regressions. Bootstrapped standard errors in parentheses, where the bootstrap was conducted at the subdistrict level. Bootstrapped standard errors conducted with 200 trials.

* significant at 10%; ** significant at 5%; *** significant at 1%

Full interaction of treatments

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
	Percent missing in…			
	Main road	Main road + ancillary	Materials	Unskilled labor
Audit	-0.111*	-0.097*	-0.142**	0.040
	(0.057)	(0.055)	(0.060)	(0.148)
Invitations	-0.031	-0.017	-0.022	-0.135
	(0.042)	(0.044)	(0.046)	(0.135)
Invitations + Comment	-0.048	-0.046	-0.082*	0.016
	(0.042)	(0.047)	(0.047)	(0.095)
Audit × Invitations	0.022	-0.025	0.078	-0.114
	(0.071)	(0.065)	(0.078)	(0.197)
Audit × (Invitations + Comment)	0.056	0.041	0.116*	-0.239
	(0.060)	(0.063)	(0.067)	(0.175)
Constant	0.303***	0.312***	0.274***	0.351***
	(0.039)	(0.035)	(0.038)	(0.098)
Observations	477	538	477	426
R-squared	0.02	0.02	0.02	0.01

Robust standard errors in parentheses, adjusted for clustering at the subdistrict level.
* significant at 10%; ** significant at 5%; *** significant at 1%